Searching for Excellence: Effective and Efficient Search Practices

Canan Bilen-Green, Karen Froelich, Sandra Holbrook
North Dakota State University
Focus on Resources for Women’s Advancement
Recruitment/Retention and Development

U.S. National Science Foundation  #HRD-0811239
September, 2008 – August, 2013
NDSU ADVANCE FORWARD

Goals

1. **Enhance recruitment**
2. Increase retention
3. Promote/advance women faculty
4. Open faculty leadership opportunities
5. Improve the climate
Promising recruitment/hiring practices*

- Search and hiring guidelines
- Search training
- Candidate pool quality assurance
- Search and hiring policy development
- Recruitment specialists/equity advisors

*Compiled from across ADVANCE programs
Two major NDSU FORWARD strategies to enhance recruitment

1. Hired assistant for faculty searches to
   - identify/update recruitment resources
   - gather marketing materials
   - monitor candidate pool for diversity
   - compile data related to the search process
   - respond to search related questions
   - process paperwork and on-line transactions
Two major NDSU FORWARD strategies to enhance recruitment cont.

2. Developed training for all academic search committee members:
   - expanded on already required training for search committee chairs (on-line)
   - provide face-to-face training for search committee members:
     o offer 2 sessions each semester
     o use female/male team to lead the training
     o provide folders with relevant materials
     o post many of the training materials on-line
     o gather feedback and suggestions consistently
Additional NDSU FORWARD strategies

3. Webinars on effective recruitment.

4. FORWARD faculty involvement during interviews for major administrative positions.

5. Financial support to bring an additional person for on-campus interview.
Components of the search committee training:

- institutional context (data)
- need for diversity
- dynamics of unconscious bias
- effective search practices from developing the position description through post-hiring - noting potential impact of unconscious bias
Some examples of typical (and unwitting) cognitive errors

- stereotypes (negative AND positive)
- raising the bar/shift ing the standards
- first impressions
- assumptions/“psychoanalyzing” the candidate
- premature ranking/digging in
- momentum of the group
Unconscious expectations/assumptions are more likely to operate where there is

- ambiguity (including lack of information)
- stress from competing tasks
- time pressure
- lack of critical mass
Reminders . . .

- Biases are often unintentional.
- Biases can be advantageous or disadvantageous to those being evaluated.
- We **all** make assumptions.
- Decisions made quickly are more susceptible to unconscious bias.
- Acknowledgement of unconscious bias can help overcome it.
Recruitment – the basics

- Effective recruitment is proactive.
- Personal contact is the most effective recruitment strategy.
- Effective recruitment is labor intensive.
- The best applicants may be people who are not looking for a position.
What do you think were the most helpful or valuable aspects of the training?
Materials & discussion were very helpful - a great review. I wish all committee members would be at this training.

Discussion of ways in which unconscious bias could come into play during the search process.

The handouts - I can keep them with me as I work through the selection process.

What are the different types of bias. Noting that it is usually unconscious. How to minimize it.

Specific strategies to implement.

The questions and follow-up discussions—these were real-world examples from the participants’ experiences.

Understanding types of bias, reference checking procedures.

Awareness of bias. Seeing where NDSU is as an institution.

What are the different types of bias. Noting that it is usually unconscious. How to minimize it.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Number of respondents</th>
<th>Strongly agree or agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I will be able to use the information that I learned today.</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My knowledge of how to identify and recruit a diverse pool of applicants.</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have acquired new information or understanding about how to address gender inequity.</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will be able to implement new strategies to address unconscious bias.</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lessons Learned

- Explore what others are doing (see ADVANCE web sites).
- Use authentically diverse search committees.
- Determine a recruiting target/know how to get there.
More Lessons Learned

- Recruit actively those who are not searching.
- Compile & monitor recruitment data.
- Be consistent about recruitment practices.
- Be prepared for resistance.
- Engage administrators.
Results: Increased #s of women faculty with recruitment efforts that are

- intentional,
- effective,
- multi-faceted.
NDSU women tenure-line faculty by rank*

*Full-time administrators are not included.
NDSU tenure-line STEM faculty by gender*

*Full-time administrators are not included.
Resources for Faculty Recruitment

Find these resources at
http://www.ndsu.edu/forward/resources/resources_for_faculty_recruitment/

- Searching for Excellence - PowerPoint handout
- Cognitive Errors card
- Reviewing Applicants, Research on Bias and Assumptions - brochure
- A Checklist for Search Committees
- References for Faculty Recruitment
- NSF's Doctorate recipients by gender and major field of study
  
  See other NSF reports for potential candidate availability based on
demographic considerations such as race/ethnicity and disability status.
- List of national rankings that have landed Fargo-Moorhead at the top.

And other search resources at
http://www.ndsu.edu/diversity/equity/recruitment_and_hiring/
The NDSU ADVANCE FORWARD project is entering its 5th year, and we’re prepared to share what we’ve learned.

If you’re interested in having FORWARD bring the search training to your campus, please contact us.
FORWARD Contact Information

- Website: [http://www.ndsu.edu/forward](http://www.ndsu.edu/forward)
- E-mail: ndsu.forward@ndsu.edu
- Canan Bilen-Green: canan.bilen.green@ndsu.edu
- Karen Froelich: karen.froelich@ndsu.edu
- Sandra Holbrook: sandra.holbrook@ndsu.edu